

M.P. STATE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION LIMITED			
Selection of Consultancy Firm for Development of Tourism Master Plan			
Pre-Bid Conference - Date: 24th January 2014, 13:30 hrs, MPSTDC's (the "Authority") Response/ Replies/ Clarifications on Queries/ Suggestions/ Clarifications of Consultancy firms.			
S. No.	RFP Reference	Query	Authority Response
SAI Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd.			
1	10 ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA	10.3. 1 Technical Capability - Should have worked in the role of lead consultant and completed at least 1 project with Government/PSU/ULB in the last 5 years in the tourism sector apart from the project quoted above for experience. The consultancy fees for each of these assignments should have been above Rs. 10 lakhs. Please consider Master Plans with Tourism component for the minimum eligibility criteria. Since such projects have similar potential with statutory provisions.	As Per RFP
2	10 ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA	10.3.2 Financial Capability - Consortium will not be allowed. Since it is not possible to have all the expertise under one roof and also the scope is very comprehensive. We request you to allow Joint Venture or Consortium to put up a competitive techno-commercial bid. Please consider.	As Per RFP
3	10.3.3 Consultancy Team	Tourism expert - Post-graduate degree in tourism / MBA Please consider Senior Urban Planner with experience of relevant tourism sector projects as Tourism Expert Town and Country planning expert - Post Graduate Engineer /MBA Please consider an expert with basic qualification of B. Arch / B.E. and Post Graduate in Town & Country Planning / Urban Planning	As Per RFP
4	Bid Due Date	We request you to extend the submission date by at least 15 days after issuing clarifications of Pre-bid queries to all consultants, so as to submit a Technically and Financially sound proposal	As Per RFP
Jones Lang			

5	7.1.3 - Substantial Private Sector Investment Plan for Tourism Development	Clarification of scope - Are we looking at land parcels possessed by the state govt. or we have to identify private land parcels? What is the approximate quantum of land parcels in possession of the state govt?	The Revenue land & State Tourism land parcel
6	7.1.3 - Marketing Strategy for Tourism Promotion	Are there any visits envisaged outside India for road shows? If yes, will the costs of such visits be included in the financial quote?	No, the actual visit will be done by MPSTDC
7	10.3.3 - Consultancy team	we propose to add another position "Infrastructure expert" to identify the infrastructure that will be required for the various tourist circuits and destinations.	As Per RFP
8	Section 10 Clause 10.3.3	Is it required for the professional staff as mentioned in the requirement to be stationed in Bhopal for full time? If no, we request you to kindly clarify the number of days required to be spent in Bhopal by the professional staff.	Only the Key Members to be stationed in Bhopal.
9	Section 10 Clause 10.3.3	Tender document also talks about deployment of junior support staff along with professional staff. We request you to kindly clarify the number of support staff required to be deployed	As required
10	Section 11 Clause 11.1	Clause says that technical proposal will be evaluated on the basis of qualification and experience of the bidder. However, it does not explain the methodology (scoring) to evaluate the technical merit of the proposal. Since the scope of work seems strategic and complex in nature, we request to evaluate the proposal using QCBS approach, using which, due weightage may be given to the technical merit of the proposal.	As Per RFP
11	Section 8 Clause 8.2	Under one of the milestones for Sub tourism plan, it states "Develop World class tourist destinations in the state". We request you to kindly clarify if this statement means identifying key tourist destinations to be developed in the state in the next five years or so.	As Per RFP

12	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3	Bidder is required to prepare pre-feasibility study report for the identified land parcels for tourism development. We request you to kindly clarify if pre-feasibility is to be done for select land parcels as identified by the department.	Yes
13	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3 Point 10	Bidder is required to plan and facilitate exposure visits for department officials. We request you to kindly clarify, if expenses for the same would be borne by the department.	No, the actual visit will be done by MPSTDC
14	-	In order to submit a technical proposal of high quality, extensive research and field work would be required. In light of the same, we request you to kindly extend the bid submission date by at least two weeks post pre bid meeting.	As Per RFP
Deloitte			
15	Page 7 Point 2 Method of Selection	We request you to consider QCBS method of selection of consultants (80:20 or any other; technical scoring having the higher weightage) to take in to account both quality and cost of services in the selection of the successful firm. Currently, no weightage has been provided to the technical proposal in the evaluation criteria.	As Per RFP
16	Page 8 Schedule of Bidding Process	We request the Authority to provide at least two weeks for preparation of proposals to the consultants after the pre-bid clarification response is issued by the Authority	As Per RFP
17	Page 19 Terms of Reference 7.1.1 Existing / Situational Analysis	We request the Authority to kindly specify the number of case studies expected to be prepared by the consultant.	As Per RFP
18	Page 19 Terms of Reference 7.1.1 Existing / Situational Analysis	We request the authority to kindly clarify if a new tourism policy for the state is expected to be prepared by the Consultant.	Policy interventions are to be proposed.

19	Page 20 Terms of Reference 7.1.2 Stakeholder consultations and analysis	We request the Authority to kindly clarify the expected sample size for the national and international tourists to be consulted for this exercise.	50 National and 25 Foreign Tourist.
20	Page 20 Terms of Reference 7.1.3 Tourism Action Plans and Proposals	We request the Authority to kindly specify the anticipated maximum number of land parcels for which the pre-feasibility reports are expected to be prepared by the consultant.	As Per RFP
21	Page 24 8.3 Penalty for Delay	The Penalty for Delay should be levied only if the delay is solely attributable to the consultant. We request the Authority to kindly edit this clause to reflect this understanding.	As Per RFP
22	Page 26 10.3.2 Financial Capability	Since varying professional skills across functions such as Policy framework, Institutional arrangements, Strategy Planning, Master Planning, PPP project structuring, Financial Assessment, Urban Planning, Marketing etc. are required for preparation of a Tourism Master Plan, we request the Authority to allow a consortium of 3 firms to participate in the process.	As Per RFP
23	Page 26 10.3.3 Consultancy Team	Considering the scope of work, we request the Authority to kindly consider adding the following mandatory experts in the consultancy team: A) Institutional Expert - Post Graduate Engineer / MBA At least 5 years of experience. B) Marketing Expert - Post Graduate in relevant discipline - At least 5 years of experience. C) PPP Expert - Post Graduate Engineer / MBA - At least 5 years of experience.	As Per RFP

24	Page 27 11.1. Evaluation of Technical Proposal	Since no scoring criteria has been provided, we understand that the Authority will pre-qualify all the consultants who meet the minimum eligibility qualifications and then make the selection on least-cost basis. In such a case, there would be no scoring for consultant's approach, methodology, work plan, etc. Also, we understand that all personnel across various proposals who meet the minimum qualification requirements will be treated equally. We request you to kindly confirm our above understanding.	Yes
Akbar Abhinav consultant			
25	-	The Amount of Turnover (INR) is Rs. 20.00 Cr. we request to reduce it for Rs. 5.00 Cr.	As Per RFP
26	-	The Amount of Earnest Money Deposit (INR) is Rs. 1,00,000/- we request to reduce it for Rs. 25,000/-	As Per RFP
27	-	Please extend date of Submission by 10 to 15 days.	As Per RFP
KPMG			
28	5.16.1	Request to change this as QCBS as recently various State Tourism departments in India have rolled out RFP's for selection of consultant on QCBS method to identify Consulting firms with Bandwidth to perform such detailed project	As Per RFP
29	8.2	Request to pay mobilization advance of 20% in ref to existing point	As Per RFP
30	8.3	In case of delay by the government in providing information and penalty structure, pls relax this clause and also request to include Arbitration and dispute resolution clause	As Per RFP
31	10.3.3	For each position of key professional, required level of support/junior personnel shall be deployed. Is it mandatory	As Per RFP

32	10.3.1(1)	The consultancy fees for these assignments should have been above Rs. 1 Cr.	As Per RFP
33	10.3.1(2)	The consultancy fees for each of this assignment should have been above Rs. 1 Cr.	As Per RFP
34	10.3.2	The applicant's annual turnover from consultancy work should be minimum Rs. 100.00 crores (Rs. One Hundred Crores only) per annum during the last three financial years i:e 2010-11, 2011-12 & 2012-13.	As Per RFP
Enerest N Young			
35	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3 Point 1	Bidder is required to prepare pre-feasibility study report for the identified land parcels for tourism development. We request you to kindly clarify if pre-feasibility is to be done for select land parcels as identified by the department.	As Per RFP
36	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3 Point 1	Tender document mentions about the investment plan and fund requirement. We request you to kindly clarify, if bidder is expected to prepare an investment plan for select land parcels as identified by the department.	Yes, Investment Plan would be required.
37	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3 Point 7	Tender document mentions about the energy mapping of MPSTDC units. We request you to kindly clarify if the bidder is required to do the power load assessment of each MPSTDC units across the state and do the projections for reducing the power requirement from conventional energy by 50%. We also request you to kindly clarify, if there is any centralized database available with the department on current power usage of all MPSTDC units.	MIS information is available.

38	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3 Point 10	Bidder is required to plan and facilitate exposure visits for department officials. We request you to kindly clarify on the number of exposure visits bidder is expected to plan. Also, please clarify if any international visits are to be planned by the bidder. We request you to kindly clarify, if expenses for the same would be borne by the department.	No, the expenses will be done by MPSTDC
39	Section 7 Clause 7.1.3 Point 10	Bidder is required to plan and facilitate exposure visits for department officials. We request you to kindly clarify, if expenses for the same would be borne by the department.	As Per RFP
40	Section 8 Clause 8.2	Under one of the milestones for Sub tourism plan, it states "Develop World class tourist destinations in the state". We request you to kindly clarify if the bidder is expected to develop an holistic development plan for tourist destinations or assistance is required in executing the development plan as well.	Develop holistic plan.
41	Section 10 Clause 10.3.3	Tender document mentions about deployment of junior support staff along with professional staff. We request you to kindly clarify if more than 4 number of support staff required to be deployed.	Yes.
42	Section 11 Clause 11.1	Tender document mentions that the technical proposal will be evaluated on the basis of qualification and experience of the bidder. However, it does not explain the methodology (scoring) to evaluate the technical merit of the proposal. Since the scope of work seems strategic and complex in nature, we request to evaluate the proposal using QCBS (Quality Cost Base Selection) approach, using which, due weightage may be given to the technical merit of the proposal.	As Per RFP

43	-	Tender document mentions about the development of world class tourist destinations and project brand MP as an international tourist destination. In light of the consideration, we request you to consider providing due weightage to the organizations which have international offices.	As Per RFP
44	-	In order to submit a technical proposal of high quality, extensive research and field work would be required. In light of the same, we request you to kindly extend the bid submission date by at least two weeks post pre bid meeting.	As Per RFP
CRISIL Infrastructure Advisory			
45	Tender Document Reference: Clause 3 – Data Sheet	We propose that spiral bound technical proposal should be allowed to be submitted instead of a hard bound proposal.	As Per RFP
46	Tender Document Reference: Clause 3 – Data Sheet	We propose that Quality and Cost based selection (QCBS) should be adopted as the selection criteria instead of lease cost basis (after prequalification on technical basis). Under the QCBS method, 70% weightage can be given to technical score and 30% to financial score.	As Per RFP
		We request you to please clarify the following in respect of the terms of reference: a. Pg-20: Clause 7.1.1 – Please clarify whether the data required for tourism supported infrastructure for each of the destinations would be provided by MP State Tourism Development Corporation Limited (MPSTDC). b. Pg-20: Clause 7.1.3 – It is not specified that how many land	No As Per RFP As Per RFP

47	Tender Document Reference: Clause 7.1: Terms of Reference	<p>parcels needs to be identified for each tourist destination. We propose that a maximum limit be specified per destination which will help us in better estimating the quantum of work involved.</p> <p>c. Pg-20: Clause 7.1.3 – Please provide details on the support expected to be provided to MPSTDC to make more intensive use of state/ central funds for tourism promotion.</p> <p>d. Pg-22: Clause 7.1.3 – Please clarify the extent of detailing required in relation to energy mapping of MPSTDC units.</p>	As Per RFP
48	Tender Document Reference: Clause 7.3.2 – Total Duration of Services	We feel that the specified duration of services of 8 months may be inadequate for completion of the required scope of work effectively. Therefore, we request the prescribed duration of the assignment to be extended to at least 15 months.	As Per RFP
49	Tender Document Reference: Clause 8.2 – Fee payment structure	The fee payable towards development of sub-tourism plans should be structured based on the number of destinations for which sub-tourism plans is proposed to be developed. This would ensure flow of fee to the consultant based on the completion of each tourism plan. In the present case, it appears that 3rd payment will be paid to the consultant upon completion of the specified 4 activities for all the sub-tourism plans.	As Per RFP
50	Tender Document Reference: Clause 8.3 – Penalty for delay	We propose that the penalty provisions for delay be reconsidered. This is because the proposed assignment involves multiple workflows, for which the consultant would have to depend on several parallel approvals and consultations with stakeholders, the timelines for which will not be in its control.	As Per RFP

51	Tender Document Reference: Clause 9.1 – Methodology for project process	We propose that while undertaking the feasibility for the projects, the methodology may focus on to dialogue between representatives of business, government as well as civil society focusing on sector wide or structural issues. Interactions with potential bidders for specific projects may be reserved for later stages after the project has been developed beyond the pre-feasibility stage.	As Per RFP
52	Tender Document Reference: Clause 10.3.3 – Consultancy team	Please clarify the meaning of the word substitution in relation to the project team. In case it refers to substitution of team experts, kindly re-consider the penalty specified for the same. Alternatively a provision that in case circumstances arise that the consultant may need to substitute an expert, the alternative expert must satisfy all qualification requirements and the substitution shall be contingent on the prior approval by the authority.	As Per RFP
53	Tender Document Reference: Clause 10.3.3 – Consultancy team	We propose that ‘Masters in Urban planning’ should also be considered as eligible qualification for the positions of ‘Tourism Expert’ and ‘Town and Country Planning Expert’.	As Per RFP
FEEDBACK INFRA			
54	Clause No. 8.3 (Penalty of Delay), Page	As per general bidding practices, we observe that in case of dispute, the matter shall be referred to General Arbitrator appointed by mutual consent hence please confirm.	Yes.
55	Bid Submission Date	We request to extend the submission date for at least 7 days after issuing clarification on queries raised by Consultants in Pre Bid Meeting schedule to be held on 24-01-2013.	As Per RFP
DPC Pvt. Ltd.			

56	TOR Clause 10.3.2	We request you to allow consortium / JV for the project. Master Plan requires a many expertise and other technical personnel from different field. Consortium would help consultant to associate with the best expertise in the same field.	As Per RFP
57	TOR Clause 11.3	We Request the above clause may be modified as 'The Consultant would be selected based on QCBS criteria. Where technical and financial weightage shall be 70:30.	As Per RFP
TATA Consultancy Services Ltd.			
58	Method of Selection	We request to have a QCBS. We request to have Technical evaluation with marks assigned to methodology, work plan, CV's along with organizational experience etc and a final selection of Consultant on QCBS 80:20 (technical:financial) formula.	As Per RFP
59	Deliverables and Time	in case MPSTDC wishes to continue with the deliverables mentioned in the RFP, the situational analysis report will need 3 months. At the end of 3 months even the Stakeholder consultation analysis report can be submitted. Also the first of the deliverables on Sub Tourism Plans where the core tourism development proposals have to be submitted, it is requested that 3 months be assigned for this phase. the time frame of the second set of deliverable can be reduced from 2 months to 1 month.	As Per RFP
60	Penalty for Delay	we request clarification that the penalty charges will be in case the delay in milestones can be attributed exclusively due to the Consultants alone.	Yes.

61	Team of Experts	The educational planner for Town and Country planner is wrongly mentioned as Post Graduate Engineering, instead it should be Town and Country planner (also called Urban and Regional Planner) or Architect with 10 year experience in Tourism Planning. The second and third positions are same. it would be good to add an enviornmental planner, given the enviornmental sensetivity of many of the tourist places. Other positions like Marketing expert, Institutional expert as required may be added by each bidder.	As Per RFP
62	Proof of Eligible assignments of Applicant	It is specified that the bidders should submit a certificate from client certifying the details submitted. We request you to accept executed Contracts of the eligible assignments or Work orders as proof of work.	Yes.
63	Power of Attorney for signing of Application	We request yout to allow submitting General Power of Attorney of person to sign bids and not specifically one prepared for MPSTDC. The company has given this power to only a select few and we will submit the PoA of the same.	Yes.
FORTRESS			
64	Clause 4.2 Project Objectives	If the project is to be developed on PPP basis then apart from the experts indicated in the RFP document, it is suggested to include PPP expert also in the Team qualification criteria.	As Per RFP
65	7.1.3 Aligning the exciting Madhya Pradesh Vision 2018 , 7.1.5 Project Delivery and Stages	As suggested in the RFP document, Tourism action plans and proposals shall align to the excisting Madhya Pradesh Vision - 2018 document which is prepared in 2013. As per the understanding, there will be only next 4 years for planning and implimentation. But in general the master plan will be prepared in view of longer periods of 20 or 30 or 50 years, so please clarify.	As Per RFP

66	Eligibility Criteria : Clause 10.3.2 Financila Capability	We request you to cinsider average annual turnover from consultancy work should be minimum Rs. 5 crs. For the last 3 finacial years.	As Per RFP
67	Association / Consortium with other other firms	We request you to kindly allow of not more then two firms.	As Per RFP
XYKno Capital Services Ltd.			
68	10.3.1.(1)	The Capabilities & Expertise,s of consultancy firm can be judge by amount of work caried out not by fees received. Normally Gov. / PSU / ULB in Tourism or Infrastructure Sector consider Project cost instead of counsuling Fees as Eligibility Criteria.	As Per RFP
69	10.3.1.(2)	The Project Cost for each of this assignment should have been above Rs. 30 Cr.	As Per RFP
70	10.3.3	Normally, the Town and Country Planning Expert should be from Planning Architecture Background instead of Engineer.	As Per RFP
JPS Associates (P) Ltd.			
71	Clause 10.0 Eligibility Criteria	We would like to request you to kindly reconsider the Financial Criterion set for being eligible to apply for the Assignment and lower the same to Rs. 5 Crores p.a. instead of Rs. 20 Crores as mentioned for creating an environment for better participation in the Bid in the interest of the quality of the Project.	As Per RFP
PCA Pvt. Ltd.			

72	(Clause 10.3.3: Consultancy Team	i. The qualification of the Town and Country Planning Expert as Post Graduate Engineer/MBA is not relevant with the scope of the work or project requirement. Instead it Graduate degree in Planning/Masters in Planning.should be changed to Post. ii. The qualification criteria of Urban Planning Expert has MBA as an option which should be deleted. The MBA qualification should not be given as an option to Post-graduate degree in Urban planning/Master in Architecture. The Urban Planning is the essential qualification for the expert and not MBA. The proposed project scope requires the Urban Planning Input and not the management inputs.	As Per RFP
73	Turnover:	Generally the financial capacity to qualify a bidder is kept to a considerable limit to encourage maximum participation of Consultants. We would request you to modify the financial turnover limit to a considerable limit and also allow association	As Per RFP
74	-	It is also suggested to add the component of Sustainable Tourism in the scope of work	As Per RFP
WOne Management Systems Private Limited			
75	Turnover	We find that one of the eligibility criteria fixed by you is on higher side i.e. Rs 20 Cr Turnover of the bidding firm for each of the last three financial years (Refer 10.3.2). Further, as per clause 10.3.1 the consultancy fee for the projects should be more than 200 projects in a year, which is extremely tough.	As Per RFP
I-WIN Advisory Services Ltd.			

76	-	As mentioned in the RFP under Para 10.3.2 Financial Capability that the consultancy firm turnover should be minimum Rs. 20 crores in last 3 financial years. In this regard, would you accept the turnover of the parent company where we are the subsidiary company of it?	As Per RFP
77	In Annexure II: Checklist of Submission	<p>Point No. 15 mentioned that Experience Certificates for Management of similar properties - what type of documents are required?</p> <p>Point No. 7 mentioned that Power of Attorney for signing of Bid – what document is appropriate – Stamp Paper or General Declaration. If stamp paper is required then how much amount of it?</p> <p>Point No. 12 mentioned that in case financial strength is being used of the Associates than Board Resolution and Letter of Undertaking – which document should we submit for it?</p>	<p>- Client Certification. -</p> <p>100 Stamp Paper.</p> <p>- Copy of Board resolution letter of Understanding.</p>
Meghraj Capital Advisors Private limited			
78	Clause 10.3.1	<p>we suggest to suitably modify the criteria as given below to emphasise on experience in Master Planning work in Tourism Sector. ☐ “The Consultants must have completed the Master Planning of Tourism sites of atleast 5 projects in last 10 years”</p> <p>☐ The Consultants must have worked with atleast one of the government agencies such as municipalities or departments of Government of Madhya Pradesh in last 5 years.</p>	As Per RFP
79	Clause 10.3.2	we request you to kindly modify this clause in the following manner - “The applicant’s annual turnover from consultancy work should be minimum Rs. 5.00 crores (Rs. Five Crores only) per annum during the last three financial years i.e. 2010-11, 2011-12 & 2012-13”	As Per RFP

80	Clause 10.3.2	The scope involves pooling together technical people having experience in tourism development and financial consultant having experience in project structuring / procurement / transaction advisory support etc. We therefore request you to kindly allow consortia to participate in the bid process.	As Per RFP
81	Clause 10.3.3	<p>We request you to kindly modify the teaming structure in the following manner</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ☐ Tourism Planner/expert (PG in tourism Sector/ MBA) – 15 years of experience in Sustainable Tourism Planning, Tourism and livelihood and product development, Preparation of Master plans, Demand estimation and Projection of Tourism facilities required to be created beyond today' period. ☐ Conservation cum General Architect (M. Arch) – 10 years of experience in conceiving and designing projects focusing sustainable construction and sustainable destination development including Infrastructure Development Plans, Utilities, Landscapes and area lightings, Projection of Architectural styles ☐ Marketing Expert (MBA/CA/CFA)– 10 years of experience in marketing Tourism projects ☐ Procurement Expert (MBA/CA/CFA) – 10 Years of experience in transaction advisory and procurement support ☐ Financial Expert (MBA/CA) – 10 years of experience in Financial Analysis and Financial Modelling 	As Per RFP
Urban Masters			
82	Turnover	We are interested in the bid. However, we find that one of the eligibility criteria fixed by you is on higher side i.e. Rs 20 Cr Turnover of the bidding firm for each of the last three financial years (Refer 10.3.2).	As Per RFP

M/s RADICAL			
83	10 ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA	Partnership or consortium of professionals should be allowed. *This would help in engaging key experts for the project with direct responsibility and legal binding. This would also help in eliminating the chances of sub-consultancy at a later stage..	As Per RFP
84	10 ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA	*The award of work should be based on QCBS instead of Least Cost *(for ensuring the quality aspect)	As Per RFP
85	Turnover	*Company turnover requirement is 20 cr/ year* : it should be reduced to 1 CR maximum This also links to the other clauses of required experience of dealing with *projects over 10 lac in value.* The quality and credibility can as such be assured through QCBS.	As Per RFP
86	-	* We suggest, that a presentation should be scheduled (carrying sizable weightage of points) *so as to ascertain that the consultant and the client shares the same understanding of the project.	As Per RFP